



National Animal Welfare Advisory Committee

General Meeting

19 August 2019
09:30 am – 4:30 pm

Level 1, TSB Building, 147 Lambton Quay
Wellington

MINUTES

Committee members: Gwyneth Verkerk (Chair), Arnja Dale, Ruth Palmer, Nick Poutu, Karin Schütz, Grant Shackell, Ingrid Visser, Julie Wagner

In attendance: s9(2)(a)

Apologies: Katie Milne

Welcome:

Any Other Business Part One (Open to the Public):

Any Other Business Part Two (Public Excluded):

PART ONE (OPEN TO THE PUBLIC)

GENERAL

O 1. Confirmation of previous minutes

The committee reviewed previous minutes (59/19) and comments were invited.

In regards to item O2 (Status of actions) - why is NAWAC Guideline 8 under review s9(2)(g)(i)

Overall, the review of the whole guideline will need to be comprehensive and go further than simply including reference to sentence.

s9(2)(g)(i)

In item O3, under poultry, it was noted that the code that has been drafted is the version drafted by the industry, and that comments have not been sent from NAWAC. Agreed that the sentence should be removed as it is incorrect. s9(2)(a) was asked to send the comments as soon as possible.

s9(2)(g)(i)

Moved (G Verkerk / K Schütz)

That the draft minutes of the general meeting held on 22 May 2019 (59/19) be accepted as a true and accurate record of the meeting, with the following changes:

- *Remove sentence: "The code that has been drafted has had its first review and comments have been sent from NAWAC", from item O4.*

The motion was put: carried.

O 2. Status of actions arising from previous meetings

The committee reviewed the list of actions (60/19). For action items not already on the agenda, the following updates were provided:

- Action 1, in regards to amending guidelines to incorporate positive welfare, is in progress.
- Action 3, in regards to sharing the outcomes paper from the Chief Executive's Animal Welfare Forum, is complete.
- Action 4, in regards to contacting EuroFAWC about animals in exhibition, entertainment and encounter, is in progress – the letter has been drafted.
- Action 5, in regards to releasing 2018 minutes, is complete.
- Action 6, in regards to talking to stakeholders about transparency, is in progress.
- Action 7, in regards to establishing number of rabbit farms, is complete. s9(2)(a) reported that there is 1 registered meat farm and 16 processors of wild rabbits in New Zealand.

- Action 10, in regards to deleting reference to cattle inductions, is complete.
- Action 12, in regards to writing to MPI about NAWAC being involved with Agricultural Compounds and Veterinary Medicines work, is in progress.
- Action 14 and 15, in regards to s9(2)(a) presentation being uploaded to Workspace and the compliance suggestions being added to NAWAC's codes review document, is complete.

s9(2)(g)(i)

O 3. NAWAC correspondence

Correspondence regarding bulldog breeding was discussed. NAWAC was concerned as it had been informed that there were claims circulating that NAWAC "approved" of a specific approach to breeding bulldogs. G Verkerk has met with DogsNZ and a letter was sent to both the bulldog breeding group, and DogsNZ, explaining NAWAC's stance – essentially confirming that NAWAC doesn't give official 'approval' for any one programme, but does support a variety of proactive approaches to improve dog welfare, and the proposal to update the breed standard reduce extreme characteristics. G Verkerk shared two DogsNZ publications referring to the new bulldog breed standard.

Regarding correspondence related to s9(2)(g)(i)

O 4. Work programme update

The work programme update (64/19) was circulated prior to the meeting. For work programme updates not already on the agenda, the following updates were provided:

- Dairy cattle code amendment – MPI's advice to the Minister has been delayed due to legal advice that a minimum standard cannot contain a delayed commencement. G Verkerk expressed significant concern about delays, given the work around winter management of stock at the moment. There are a lot of strong recommendations being shared about certain types of stand-off pads, but some would not meet the proposed minimum standards (e.g. if they are constructed from riverstones). G Verkerk stated that the amendment must be issued before farmers spend money constructing stand-off pads that are not compliant.
- Animals in the wild – The snares report is still on track to be recommended to the Minister of Agriculture after the dairy cattle code of welfare amendment.
- Poultry – s9(2)(a) reported that the draft code of welfare for broiler breeders should go out for initial consultation in the next month or two. NAWAC questioned whether the changes that they had suggested had been made to the code, as the version they had seen was very much a first draft. s9(2)(a) is due to make these changes as soon as possible, and confirmed that the amended version would be seen by the poultry subcommittee and NAWAC before consultation.

- Farrowing crates – there have been no significant updates regarding the ongoing judicial review process brought by SAFE and the New Zealand Animal Law Association. MPI is expecting the judicial review to continue for the remainder of 2019.
- Greyhounds – It was noted that documents related to the most recent greyhound welfare committee meeting are available on Workspace. The main points were staffing changes. s9(2)(a) expressed concern regarding governance of the greyhound welfare work; when welfare committee makes recommendations, it is often told in response that the Board is managing the decision/process. It was noted that the Minister has written to Greyhound Racing New Zealand to remind them to keep to the Hansen report recommendations. It was questioned at what point NAWAC will make a decision as to the value of these meetings? Noted that NAWAC is an observer, and is not endorsing their work. It was suggested that the outcomes from the next meeting will likely decide as to whether NAWAC will continue to send an observer.

In regards to horse racing, the thoroughbred racing association has put together a new strategy which has been shared with MPI but not NAWAC. Have suggested that an industry representative attends the November meeting to present this to NAWAC. The review of the Racing Integrity Unit is due to be published in the next few weeks.

Action – s9(2)(a) and s9(2)(a) to circulate report from next meeting of the Greyhound Welfare Committee. NAWAC to make decision on ongoing level of involvement.

O 5. Committee members' reports on recent presentations and attendance at conferences

G Verkerk – Has had a trip to Europe. Noted high number of vegetarian/vegan options, and Scottish sheep with longer tails. Attended science week in Australia and presented to the animal welfare chapter around dealing with social media. One particularly interesting presentation was about cow-calf separation.

R Palmer – Visited Canada, noted innovative wildlife management including bridges over highways.

J Wagner – Attended AgFarm meeting. Minister Sage was a presenter and was asked about genetic engineering; said it was completely off the table. Attended NZ Institute of Primary Industry management meeting.

A Dale – Attended ANZCCART conference with G Shackell and s9(2)(a) Great conference – including talks on fish and sharks, and what kind of anaesthetic to use for surgery and tagging.

G Shackell – Also attended ANZCCART. Visited dairy farm afterwards and saw robotic milking and back scratchers for cows. It was a grazing system but the animals could milk themselves when they chose; some would choose to do so more than 3 times a day.

K Littin added interesting presentations about open ocean aquaculture; keeping an eye on the issue for NAWAC's eventual work.

I Visser – Co-authoring a presentation for Marine Sciences conference in Neslon on leopard seals. Has published a paper on leopard seals. Has convinced DOC not to classify them as vagrants; they will be classified as residents. Noted that the leopard seals that are visiting regularly are eating seaweed; i.e. some are not carnivores, they are omnivores. Also updated on a dead orca found on the Wellington coast.

N Poutu – Attended biosecurity institute conference, met with person developing traps that are welfare friendly, and is testing his traps to the NAWAC guideline. Good to see guideline being used. Saw presentation on rat-specific toxin.

K Schüz – Attended heat stress workshop in June with DairyNZ and farmers. Lots of discussion about trees, heat stress in Canterbury. Found that they are being proactive. Also attended science week at the Gold Coast and presented about importance of clean drinking water for dairy cows. Interesting talks about *m. bovis* response. Didn't attend International Society for Applied Ethology conference in Norway but noted that fish farming was big topic there.

O 6. MPI update and discussion of information circulated by MPI

The update was taken as read. There were no comments.

STRATEGY AND PLANNING

O 7. Issues register

Fireworks – It was noted that SPCA has been approached for a submission.

Bees – MPI advised that the need for advice to the Minister is uncertain. It may be deprioritised compared to other issues. G Verkerk noted that she and G Shackell were meeting with the Minister later in the day, and G Shackell noted that fish larvae and the definition of 'animal' in the Animal Welfare Act will come up on the agenda as well.

O 8. Transparency & website

s9(2)(a) confirmed that NAWAC's minutes for 2018 meetings were now available online. At this stage, did not have time to post agendas as well.

NAWAC requested updates on level of engagement on NAWAC documents.

Action: s9(2)(a) to gather engagement statistics for NAWAC's webpage

Regarding NAWAC's website, s9(2)(a) is working with NAEAC secretary s9(2)(a) and MPI's web services and IT teams. The advice has been to set up a separate website to MPI using a provider and a recommended provider has been identified. There has been one meeting so far and the company is keen to create modern and unique websites for the committees. A quote has been provided to MPI, and the money is not available in the animal welfare budget. Budget discussions are ongoing.

O 9. Animals in exhibition, entertainment and encounter

G Verkerk shared the news that G Doole has resigned from NAWAC due to family reasons. He had been the chair of the subcommittee. G Verkerk asked for a replacement.

s9(2)(a) gave an update on rodeos. He attended the first rodeo welfare committee meeting with G Verkerk. It was an interesting meeting and the main theme was establishing the governance model and having the chair attend rodeo board meetings. Upcoming agendas include tracking animals, reviewing veterinary templates, and reviewing injury data. G Verkerk stated that she was happy with setup and chair s9(2)(a) will attend future meetings and report back to NAWAC,

similarly to the greyhound welfare committee. A Dale is also on the committee representing the SPCA. It was noted that the rodeo industry has the financial ability to support the committee, but is unlikely to be able to fund research.

Regarding the 3E's, G Verkerk shared hard copies of where she had got to with the framework. Used greyhounds as an example but noted that the framework is a first draft, and needs to be handed to subcommittee at this point.

The new chair will need to work with the subcommittee and s9(2)(a) to come up with a framework to send out for consultation soon. G Shackell agreed to chair the subcommittee. R Palmer and A Dale were happy to help or join. I Visser is happy to co-chair over the longer term.

It was noted that the framework would need to also be able to take into account risks to society, and also allow for variability between institutions/activities e.g. not all zoos operate at the same level in terms of how they work to improve outcomes for animals.

Members asked MPI and G Verkerk about the timeframe for replacement NAWAC members. Interviews are complete, and new suggestions have been put forward. MPI is preparing documentation for the Minister to make the final decision.

O 10. Codes and regulations

s9(2)(a) gave an update, stating that regulations mean that consequential amendments need to be made to codes.

It was noted that in 2018, minor changes were made to the codes; but that decision, in regards to the pig code in particular, is currently under judicial review. Essentially, the decision to include MPI-consulted rules into codes of welfare is under dispute with no timeline for a ruling. The decision to amend codes will need to be made in the meantime.

NAWAC agreed to the recommendations in the subcommittee's memo (68/19), noting that s9(2)(a) will continue to work on the codes until mid-September.

Moved (G Verkerk / A Dale):

That NAWAC agrees with recommendations made in memo 68/19.

The motion was put: carried.

O 11. Sentience and NAWAC guidelines

s9(2)(a) summarised the information in memo 69/19. The wording to amend NAWAC's guidelines to acknowledge animal sentience is largely taken from NAWAC's website.

The use of the word "feelings" was questioned. It was suggested that new members should have access to the science around sentience/feelings/emotions.

After some discussion, suggested adding "an increasing body of science reflects that...."

G Verkerk stated that, anecdotally, rural professionals seem to have difficulty understanding the direction of travel with sentience. J Wagner suggested it can also be an issue in the veterinary profession.

Action – MPI to contact NZVA on NAWAC's behalf around the next NZVA conference and importance of sentience being communicated correctly.

It was pointed out that the audience for the guidelines is NAWAC; how often are people reading these guidelines? Noted that they will also be interpreted into codes of welfare.

Suggested that for other people, there should be another way to communicate this to them. Perhaps a media release or statement.

Suggested a media release to draw attention to the videos and guidelines. The focus from now on should not be the concept of sentience but how it is understood and applied.

It was agreed to add "emotions" in front of "feelings".

Action – Sector liaison team and secretariat to explore social media posts and articles in industry publications around sentience with the aim of upskilling the public to use and apply the concept.

I Visser noted that New Zealand's example of including the word in the Animal Welfare Act is referenced around the world; there is an opportunity to promote this.

Moved (G Verkerk / R Palmer):

To accept the proposed changes to the guidelines, with the above amendments.

The motion was put: carried.

PRESENTATIONS AND UPDATES

O 12. *Safeguarding update*

s9(2)(a) provided an update regarding the sector liaison work programme.

On the codes review work, all reviews are focused on how each industry is applying and meeting their own code. They are all proceeding at the same time although the dairy industry is leading in terms of work done. Some issues identified by each industry may end in recommendations made to NAWAC; or they may result in educational/upskilling work.

The end of life/recumbent cattle project is beginning, with help from s9(2)(a) as it will be focused on human behaviour change, and using data from verification services.

Winter grazing in cattle is a hot issue with the formation of a new taskforce. s9(2)(a) team is organising the terms of reference and papers for the Taskforce. Their first meeting is on Friday.

The implementation of surgical and painful procedures regulations is also underway.

NAWAC initiated a discussion around sentience and reaching out to people about the concept. They requested help with

- Teaching children and adults about sentience
- Normalising the word sentience
- Teaching farmers about sentience, perhaps using the feeling of pain and the surgical procedures regulations as a jumping off point.

s9(2)(a) gave an update on the cull cattle report which is in NAWAC's action list and recommended it be removed, because the group is taking a new approach and so is back to square one. Updates will still come, but in a different format.

O 13. Shade and shelter for livestock

s9(2)(a) arrived to present to NAWAC on shade and shelter. In particular he covered:

- Animals need shade and shelter, but aren't always getting it
- The code of welfare already requires it
- Telling people about what to do evidently hasn't worked – so a survey of farmers and others was undertaken to identify barriers
- Barriers include resources, standards being difficult to enforce, impact on productivity, and knowledge of interventions and their success
- Farmers do want to provide shelter and this is driven by care for their animals, financial considerations and professional pride
- Interventions may include enforcement and encouragement; challenging the culture of farming; ensuring interventions are farmer-led; and implementing varying methods for different types of farmers
- MPI's role is seen as supporting and engaging

There was discussion around the role of science, using One Billion Trees to get more shelter belts, and educating farmers on positive economic returns from providing shelter. G Verkerk suggested a need for a holistic longer-term view of environment planning that combines animal welfare.

O 14. Live animal export

s9(2)(a) from MPI's animal exports team, arrived to present to NAWAC on live animal export. In particular he covered:

- Overview of animal exports and the process of obtaining an Animal Welfare Export Certificate
- Exemptions to an Animal Welfare Export Certificate
- The 2018 amendment to the Animal Welfare Act that allows MPI to gather post-voyage reports and allowed MPI to consider reputational risk when looking at a shipment

There was discussion around ensuring that welfare tracking occurs overseas. I Visser suggested letters of continuity, as used for orca when sent between some countries. There was also discussion around measures of welfare other than mortality on ships. MPI does require injury reports, but mortality is the main measure. Questions were raised around day-old chick welfare and mortality levels. MPI requires reports of mortality over 5%. Average is around 1%.

O 15. Vertebrate toxic agents review

s9(2)(a) (Agricultural Compounds and Veterinary Medicines team) arrived to update NAWAC on ACVM work including a review of the rules around Vertebrate Toxic Agents and brodifacoum. In particular he covered:

- Overview of the ACVM team.
- s9(2)(g)(i) [REDACTED]
- There are ubiquitous sales to and by unauthorised persons and sales records are often not kept.
- s9(2)(g)(i) [REDACTED]
- Will be important to balance aims of PredatorFree 2050 against the concerns of ACVM.

Action: Presentation to be shared with NAWAC.

There was discussion around carcass removal in an area where poison is used. Noted that this requirement is only "where practicable". Idea is to remove visible carcasses along a bait line to reduce secondary poisoning.

Action: NAWAC to submit on the review.

Discussion document will be written within the next couple of weeks.

O 16. Animals in emergencies

s9(2)(a) gave an overview of MPI's animals in emergencies work.

MPI's responsibilities under the National Civil Defence emergency management plan 2015 (National CDEM plan) are to coordinate animal welfare services in emergencies (like earthquakes and floods) and ensure planning is in place.

Animal welfare falls under the overall "welfare" function of CDEM.

With no further items to discuss, G Verkerk closed the meeting at 4:30pm.