



National Animal

Committee

Welfare Advisory

General Meeting

13 November 2019

09:30 am – 4:30 pm

**Level 1, TSB Building, 147 Lambton Quay
Wellington**

MINUTES

Committee members: Gwyneth Verkerk (Chair), Arnja Dale, Katie Milne, Ruth Palmer, Nick Poutu, Grant Shackell, Ingrid Visser

9 (2)(a)

Apologies: Julie Wagner, Karin Schutz

Welcome:

Any Other Business Part One (Open to the Public): Agenda items added – codes and regulations processes; mātauranga Māori

Any Other Business Part Two (Public Excluded): None

PART ONE (OPEN TO THE PUBLIC)

GENERAL

O 1. Confirmation of previous minutes

Moved (A Dale / G Shackell)

That the draft minutes of the general meeting held on 19 August 2019 (88/19) be adopted as a true and accurate record of the meeting.

The motion was put: carried.

O 2. Status of actions arising from previous meetings

The committee reviewed the list of actions (89/19). For action items not already on the agenda, the following updates were provided:

- Action 1, in regards to reviewing Guideline 08, is still in progress. The guideline is under review pending the ruling from the Judicial Review process. The hearing is scheduled for June 2020.
- Action 2, in regards to asking EuroFAWC about the use of animals in entertainment, is complete. The other committees were very helpful in their responses, and they have all been saved in a folder on Workspace for the 3E's subcommittee to access and consider.

Action: email the EuroFAWC responses to NAWAC, for those members who have difficulty accessing Workspace.

- Actions 3 and 4, regarding putting NAWAC agendas online and talking to stakeholders, are in progress and will be discussed further under the transparency agenda item. Noted that G Verkerk had discussed this with SAFE at a meeting about broiler chickens the day before this committee meeting.
- Action 5, regarding a decision on whether to continue with the greyhound welfare committee, is complete. It was explained that ^{9 (2)(a)} and G Verkerk had a call with the greyhound welfare committee chair Jim Edwards, and with the acting CEO of GRNZ. The CEO is committed to following up on board decisions and the concerns around governance from the welfare committee. NAWAC will stay on the committee for now. It was noted that no progress report from GRNZ has gone to Ministers since the second quarter of 2019.
- Action 6, in regards to sharing NAWAC's web engagement statistics, is complete. It was noted that there is low engagement overall. A logo was suggested for NAWAC to differentiate itself.

Action: G Verkerk and G Shackell to raise website progress and budget concerns with MPI's DG Ray Smith at their next meeting, anticipated to be in Feb 2020.

- Action 7, in regards to engaging with NZVA about animal sentience, is pending.
- Action 8, in regards to MPI engaging with the public about sentience, is in progress. There have been a few social media posts organised on the topic. NAWAC requested that they are sent direct links to these posts when they are made.
- Action 9, to share the Agricultural Compounds and Veterinary Medicines presentation, is complete.
- Action 10, for NAWAC to submit on the brodifacoum review, is pending. Discussion documents are anticipated before the end of the year.

O 3. NAWAC correspondence

One comment was raised on the letter regarding donkey milking – is it considered to be a current issue? There is not enough information to say. The response to the correspondent was that the code of welfare for horses and donkeys contains welfare standards, and if they are not adequate, the need for new requirements will need to be specified.

O 4. Work programme update

The work programme update (96/19) was circulated prior to the meeting. For work programme updates not already on the agenda, the following updates were provided:

- Regulations – MPI's Regulatory Reform & Animal Welfare team are considering submissions and working with the Parliamentary Counsel Office to draft the surgical and painful procedure regulations.
- Dairy cattle code amendment – The code has been issued, but does not include the minimum standard setting a limit of 150 days in an off-paddock facility. This is because legal advice was that transitions can no longer be contained in minimum standards and must be implemented via regulation. ^{9 (2)(a)} shared process; the team is currently finding farmers to talk to for the Regulatory Impact Statement, including working with MPI's human welfare team because some farmers using barns have been affected by *Mycoplasma bovis*.
- Wild animals – N Poutu reminded the committee that the snares report was due to be presented to the Minister following the dairy cattle housing amendment. ^{9 (2)(a)} suggested discussing this alongside other priorities. It was noted that the last NAWAC-wide review of the report was in 2017.

Action – Wildlife subcommittee to bring snares report to whole committee.

Deer repellent will be addressed within the Vertebrate Pest Guideline. The outline for the guideline has been drafted. Trap testing guideline 09 has been published.

- Exhibition, entertainment and encounter – to be discussed. In regards to rodeo, ^{9 (2)(a)} attended the New Zealand Cowboy Association's (NZCRA's) second animal welfare meeting. The first issue was learning from the greyhound welfare committee regarding governance. The committee made its first recommendation: to consider implementing random drug testing in case there is pain relief being used to mask issues in the animals. They are working through job descriptions for the president of NZRCA who is also chair of the board, and drafting a description for the animal welfare convener role. There is a convener but no documented process. Funding for research was discussed, including sources from rodeo attendees via tickets pricing and from MPI. A Dale added that SPCA offered to digitise 10 years of injury data/vet reports. Noted that MPI Animal Welfare Inspectors (AWIs) will be attending every rodeo in the 2019/2020 season, as directed by the Minister of Agriculture. The next meeting is 24 January, and then the welfare committee will attend Lawrence rodeo.
- Farrowing crates – The hearing date for Judicial Review has been set for June 2020.
- Fractures in dairy cattle – Some survey results are due from DairyNZ, G Verkerk to follow up.
- Sentience – Discussion of the importance of including sentience in text for the new code of welfare for poultry breeder birds. ^{9 (2)(a)} working with social media team on sentience posts.

Action – ^{9 (2)(a)} to share social media links when posted.

O 5. Committee members' reports on recent presentations and attendance at conferences

K Milne – Attended animal welfare conference in Paris and Luxembourg in May, including a visit to a winter garden organic chicken farm. Aquaculture was presented as needing to double in size by 2030 to meet demand. Also went to Bali for world research organisation conference. Noted integrated systems on small land (e.g. some cattle, some fish, chickens, crops - banding together to share land). Visited ZIP and predator free eradication area; viewed experimental remote monitoring.

G Shackell and G Verkerk – Attended Animal Behaviour and Welfare Consultative Committee meeting in Wellington at the racing headquarters.

N Poutu – Attended trip organised by Sika foundation. Also receiving feedback regarding application of amended Guideline 09.

I Visser - Attending world mammal marine conference coming up in Barcelona.

A Dale – Attended One Welfare conference. Australian and New Zealand Council for Care of Animals in Research and Teaching conference coming in July 2020.

R Palmer – Attended local pest control meetings.

O 6. MPI update and discussion of information circulated by MPI

There was one comment regarding the operational research on electrical stunning of crustaceans. s 9(2)(b)(ii)

PRESENTATIONS AND UPDATES

O 7. Thoroughbred Welfare Reform

Marty Burns, Thoroughbred Racing New Zealand, arrived to present to NAWAC on NZTR's animal welfare strategy. Main points included:

- Vision for thoroughbred welfare in New Zealand is that a thoroughbred should be provided a good life, with the care and conditions that allow the horse to thrive and perform to its natural abilities.
- The five domains model underpins the science that informs NZTR's welfare aims.
- NZTR has developed welfare guidelines, and asked for NAWAC's feedback if possible.
- NZTR had to work on the concept of an accountable person, because racehorses not cared for by a licensed person were not necessarily falling under the guidelines.
- NZTR has powers of inspection and direction.
- The idea of a national register of all breeds of horses; which would be a big, long-term project, but it has been done in the UK and would provide welfare and biosecurity benefits.
- The Australian exposé of racehorse slaughter by ABC was discussed. The stance of NZTR is that healthy horses should be rehomed. If all avenues have been exhausted and horses must go to slaughter, the standards for large animals in commercial slaughter code should be differentiated between horse and cattle; they needed to be handled differently.
- Question: The numbers of horses quoted by the exposé vs the numbers quoted by Racing Australia did not match up at all. How good are New Zealand's numbers? Unfortunately, a

number of horses could not be quoted today. NZTR doesn't have tracking to that level yet. Currently looking at assigning staff and setting up systems for this.

- The importance of partnerships – e.g. Horse Ambulance Trust and many others.
- Pending enhancements include end of life consideration, traceability, further restriction on use of the whip, and a Thoroughbred Welfare annual forum (potential for a NAWAC attendee).

G Verkerk thanked Marty Burns for his update.

O 8. *Safeguarding update*

9 (2)(a) arrived to give an update from the sector liaison team. Main points included:

- The Farm to Processor Animal Welfare Forum has completed several of their reviews of the codes of welfare, and have done an excellent job. Reviews have been uploaded to workspace and will be taken into account for the codes review work item.
- The Chief Executive's Animal Welfare Forum is disbanded, to be replaced with a small group convened by Chris Rodwell. Looking at a replacement all-day workshop for June 2020.
- Recruitment: MPI is recruiting three staff for the liaison team, one based in Wellington and two to be regional.
- The team is attending upcoming A&P shows.
- The intensive winter grazing report is with the Minister. Industries have been asked to provide initial feedback. There is an expectation that the three codes of welfare affected by the recommendations will be reviewed by 2021. Noted that sentence is central in the report.

Action: Share embargoed winter grazing report with NAWAC.

- End of life cull cattle – the working group held meeting to address it via human behaviour change methods, which turned out to be a transformative approach; the working group is reinvigorated to tackle the issue.

O 9. *Live animal export review update*

9 (2)(a) gave an update on the live animal export review.

Main points included:

- Documents may be online as soon as Friday. Consultation is six weeks.
- The options available range from a total ban, to conditional prohibition, to making minor changes to improve the current system.
- One idea put forward in the discussion paper related to whether or not there would be value in having independent monitors on board vessels; as an independent advisor, NAWAC may be well placed to consider the choices available.
- Happy to meet with NAWAC to discuss should the committee wish to make its own submission.
- Seeking information from rural communities as well to understand impact of different options.

O 10. *Compliance update*

9 (2)(a), presented compliance statistics from the previous quarter.

STRATEGY AND PLANNING

O 11. Meat chicken breeder code of welfare update

⁹ (2)(a) and G Verkerk updated the committee on progress. In particular:

- The poultry subcommittee met with SAFE on 12 November and discussed the code of welfare/regulations work plan for minimum standards and regulations. Several discussion points were around selective breeding and the role of genetics in the poultry industry. The selective breeding opinion paper was noted in this regard. SAFE noted a large campaign for meat chickens is to be launched before Christmas.
- The poultry subcommittee also met with industry representatives on 12 November. The subcommittee asked questions around the management of breeder chickens with the aim of incorporating this information in the draft code.
- A field visit to see a breeder farm has been scheduled before Christmas. Subcommittee aiming to complete a draft code to consider in February, and put this draft out for public consultation before May meeting.

Additional agenda item: Codes and regulations processes

⁹ (2)(a) passed around a flow chart that attempts to show how regulations and codes of welfare can be drafted alongside each other. In general, ⁹ (2)(a) team does codes, ⁹ (2)(a) team does regulations. The poultry breeder code will be the first time they proceed together. It will be a learning curve, and MPI is likely to need to check in with NAWAC often.

There was discussion around maintaining clear independence and processes.

A Dale suggested doing a code for both layer and meat chicken breeders and including regulations.

I Visser: cetaceans in captivity

I Visser was due to leave early, and so presented a paper regarding marine mammals in captivity prior to the main prioritisation discussion.

Main points:

- There is a 'loophole' in Marine Mammals Protection Act that allows cetaceans to be kept.
- Cetaceans suffer in captivity.
- There has been a history in other countries of cetaceans being exported following stranding events.

Discussion centred on the idea that Government's policy intent is already to avoid cetaceans in captivity, whatever the technical possibilities are. Could an amendment be made to the Marine Mammals Protection Act via the Statutes Amendment Bill?

A Dale suggested that the focus on cetaceans is too small; the same arguments to avoid captivity can apply to elephants and other species.

There was discussion around connecting with DOC and the Minister of Conservation.

I Visser had discussed cetacean sanctuaries. Concern raised over the idea. If animals cannot be kept humanely in captivity, why would sanctuaries be an option? Discussed need for this to be short-term.

Suggestion that NAWAC is not the correct place to initiate the work because the Marine Mammals Protection Act is administered by DOC.

NAWAC was in agreement that no cetaceans should be in captivity, and no cetaceans should be exported from New Zealand.

G Verkerk suggested a small working group to look at potential options including R Palmer and I Visser.

O 12. Transparency & website

9 (2)(a) had worked on putting agendas online, including wording to request RSVPs from the public. However, ran into problems when considering redactions and presenters that had not been briefed. G Verkerk requested a documented procedure to follow for inappropriate behaviour by any public that might attend meetings. 9 (2)(a) to aim to advertise meetings now in February.

R Palmer noted that the Ombudsman has released an amended ruling around naming of public servants. Suggested adding 10 minutes at the start of meetings for public participation so that people don't have to wait to participate.

Regarding NAWAC's website, 9 (2)(a) explained that she and NAEAC's secretary had met with supplier & web teams and obtained quote. Were advised there was not enough budget for quote, but a smaller amount has been found from elsewhere and the provider was asked for revised scope in line with available budget. Process for govt.nz applications is underway. However, the website cost has been declined as the available funds only give certainty for support/maintenance for 6 months. A case will be put together for the 2020 budget (decided in June).

9 (2)(a) also explained that the Workspace website, hosted by DIA, is being decommissioned. NAWAC will soon see a message to this effect on the site. MPI is already testing an alternative and aims to get it built before Workspace is ended (December 2019), because many teams across MPI are using Workspace.

If NAWAC members have suggestions for improvements please email 9 (2)(a) to pass on while the new solution is still under development. The need for downloading multiple documents at once was raised and will be passed to the developers.

O 13. Animals in exhibition, entertainment and encounter

G Shackell and 9 (2)(a) summarised memo 98/19, which sets out a draft framework for considering animal welfare considerations alongside societal value of animal activities in the 3E's.

The framework is proposed as an amendment to Guideline 07. An opinion paper which will use the framework will follow in 2020.

The framework has been given the tentative name Kaupapa pāpori which still needs to be consulted with kaumātua.

It was suggested that the 'animal' column should be first.

Discussion about consultation process. Clarified that any discussion document would be given to all of NAWAC first. A document will be sent to NAWAC for discussion at the February meeting.

Discussion around who fills in the information when running the framework – this is still up for discussion.

Additional agenda item: mātauranga Maori discussion

R Palmer noted that the joint NAWAC/NAEAC workshop had a lot of good information for the committees. Space needs to be created to discuss what it means, what comes next?

The wildlife subcommittee had been discussing Maori worldview when looking at the draft of the humane vertebrate pest control guideline; but the whole committee needs to be informed and involved as these discussions and decisions should be at the core of NAWAC's work.

G Shackell is working on developing a whakataki for both Committees. Have had conversations with 9 (2)(a) on NAEAC, and about different names for each Committee. Have had conversation with 9 (2)(a) about protocol at NAEAC meetings e.g. a karakia, or a statement of principles at the start of the meeting in Te Reo.

Suggested carrying on the joint subcommittee that plans the workshop, in order to facilitate work like this. A Dale dropped out due to workload; N Poutu agreed to join. R Palmer agreed to chair.

O 14. Humane vertebrate pest control guideline

The humane vertebrate pest control guideline had been discussed earlier in the meeting; general feeling was that the Māori perspective should not be a separate section but should be woven throughout.

O 15. Prioritisation for 2020

NAWAC's 2019 work plan was projected for review.

It was noted that timelines needed to be reviewed and updated.

Dairy housing can be removed as it is complete. The other 4 items should stay.

Sheep milking can be removed from the issues under management because it is in the codes review programme. Sentience is also part of codes review, but should stay under management as NAWAC wants to see it continue to be actively promoted.

The point was raised that MPI compliance statistics are informing NAWAC's plan, but not SPCA's, and this would be further useful information to assess priorities.

Action: SPCA compliance statistics to be presented to NAWAC on an ongoing basis.

G Verkerk had to attend a Select Committee and left before the conclusion of the discussion. NAWAC fell below quorum and into an informal discussion. Agreement on the work plan will be made in February 2020. G Shackell chaired the remainder of the meeting.

Before leaving, G Verkerk noted that it was K Milne's final meeting and thanked K Milne for her work on NAWAC over the 6 years she had been a member. The expertise provided from a farming perspective is invaluable to the committee's considerations.

NAWAC then considered papers 99/19 (issues register) and 102/19 (codes review process).

There was provisional agreement with the codes review timeline, pending confirmation at the next meeting. A Dale noted that a rabbit code of welfare will be presented to NAWAC in early 2020.

It was suggested that deer goes next to sheep & beef and dairy on the list, because they are all part of the winter grazing taskforce recommendations. Layer hen breeders should be added into the meat breeders code under development. Suggest not revoking circus code as that may stir a lot of activity where it is not needed, because there are no circuses using exotic animals.

Regarding issues aside from the codes of welfare, NAWAC first discussed fish welfare. There was agreement that this should be prioritised; 2020 should involve visiting farms, and meeting experts.

In regards to snares, the secretariat should double check that submissions are needed; can it go straight to Minister? Agreed to send around wildlife subcommittee again. Ideally would be off NAWAC's desk as soon as possible.

Buffalo milking raised suggest to place alongside deer/donkey milking on watching brief document.

NAWAC maintained its interest in regards to veterinary paraprofessionals. First step would be to hear from NZVA. Add as an item under management.

It was raised that there will be no companion animal issues as a priority in 2020. Is NAWAC comfortable that there are no priorities in that area? There was discussion around puppy farming and backyard breeders. This issue should remain on the watching brief, perhaps to pick up in 2021. The rabbit code is also a companion animal issue.

Regarding cetaceans, NAWAC supports I Visser's work and suggestions; it needs to be raised with DOC and the Minister of Conservation in the first instance.

O 16. Meeting dates for 2020

The following dates are suggested:

- Tuesday 18th February
- Tuesday 19th May (Monday 18th – tentative hold for field trip)
- Thursday 20th August
- Wednesday 18th November

With no further items, G Shackell closed the meeting at 4:30pm.